



The Malad Co-operative Housing Society Ltd.

REGD. NO. BOM/HSG-38 OF 1965

1/9, Podar Park, Podar Road, Malad (East), MUMBAI - 400 097. Tel.: 2883 4966

Mob.: 98330 03421 E-mail : mchs1965@rediffmail.com

Ref. No.: 059/2023-24

Minutes of the Special General Meeting

Date : 30-Aug-2023

Date: 20th August 2023

Time: 11:00 am

Location: Temple area of the Malad Co-op Housing Society Ltd, Poddar Park, Malad East, Mumbai-400097.

The Special General Meeting was convened on the 20th of August, 2023, at 11:00 am at the Temple area of the Malad Co-op Housing Society Ltd, Poddar Park, Malad East, Mumbai-400097.

1. Adjournment of Meeting due to Lack of Quorum:

The meeting was adjourned at 11:00 am due to the lack of quorum, with a new schedule set for 11:30 am.

2. Opening Remarks and Invocation:

Mr. Omprakash Sharma initiated the meeting by extending a warm welcome to the Members. He also introduced Mr. Nirav Hingoo, the appointed PMC (Project Management Consultant), and requested a moment of silence to remember and pray for the Members who have passed away.

3. Chairperson for the Meeting:

Mrs. Vibha Muchala was requested to assume the role of the chairperson in the absence of Secretary Shri Rajkumar Gupta and Chairman Shri Rakesh Agarwal. She was entrusted with conducting the proceedings of the meeting.

4. Acknowledgment of Redevelopment Committee and Core Communication Team:

The Redevelopment Committee and Redevelopment Core Communication team were acknowledged and thanked for their valuable contributions to the Society's redevelopment efforts.

5. Reading of Meeting Agenda:

Mrs. Vibha Muchala read out the agenda items for the meeting.

6. Approval of Minutes of Last SGM:

Agenda No.1 focused on the approval of the minutes of the previous Special General Meeting held on 25th June 2023.

"The minutes of the Last SGM held on 25th June, 2023 were read and passed unanimously."

Proposed by Milind Pathare (Flat No. 4/47)

Seconded by Sanjay Ajmera (Flat No. 3/18)

7. Finalization of List of Amenities:

Agenda No.2 dealt with finalizing the list of amenities. Mr. Hingoo's list of amenities, previously circulated with the SGM notice dated 12th August 2023, was read out. Members contributed additional suggestions during the meeting in addition to list of amenities shared along with the notice of Special General Meeting dated 12th August, 2023, including a well, temple area, solar energy, separate cycle parking, soundproof windows facing the railway, and Vastu compliance. Mr. Hingoo explained these amenities in accordance with Regulation DCPR 2034.

"The list of amenities was read, consented by the Members present in the meeting and passed unanimously".

Proposed by Miss Laxmi Kasbekar (Flat No. 4/5)

Seconded by Mrs. Babita Bubna (Flat No. 5/25)

8. Selection of Builders and Tender Process:

Agenda No.3 covered the finalization of the tender process for selecting builders.

Mr. Nirav Hingoo explained Members about the tender process and explained the meaning of Open tender and Close tender. Further, he elaborated that considering the size of our society's redevelopment project if we opt for open tender process below are the key challenges which are expected, based on his prior experience:

Advantages & Disadvantages explained by Mr. Nirav Hingoo

Open Tender	Close Tender
Time Consuming process	Fast Track (if we want to take the advantage of the 50% reduction in premium of FSI for CDS 33(9))
Unknown developers	Apple to apple comparison
difficult in case for unknown developers	Research and Development can be carried out by the Society
Not identified	Back ground identified
Any normal developer	Only Top selected Brands to participate
Not sure about the financial capabilities of developer	Awareness about the developers
Selection process of developer is difficult	Selection process of developer is easier since all top brands

Further, based on above assessment, Mr Nirav Hingoo was of the view that our Society shall opt for Close tender.

After briefing about the challenges of Open tender and benefits of Close tender, Mr. Nirav Hingoo handed over the floor to Mr. Hitesh Padliya, who provided a comprehensive explanation of both Open and Close tender processes to the Members.

Further, he elaborated about the meetings done with Developers by the redevelopment committee and redevelopment communication team with couple of developers (in last 2-3 months) with an intent to understand and have fillers about their interest in redevelopment of our Society. He also listed the names of top developers, including Oberoi, Rustomjee, Hiranandani, Kanakia, Suraksha, Kewal Kiran, Runwal, Bhoomi, Veena Developers, Mahindra Lifespace and Kolte Patil, who have expressed interest in our Society's redevelopment. However, these developers recommended their participation in the Close Tender process.

Further, if any member having any suggestion of any good reputed developer which is not included in above mentioned list then the member can suggest the name of the developer to the Society office before the date of issue of tender based upon the criteria to be put in Tender document without agents and should have direct approach with the Developer. No new entry of the Developer will be allowed after the Tender date (to be finalised by the Society).

Mr. Sanjay Ajmera, a Member of the society proposed that the above suggestion from member shall be provided considering the minimum criteria for the selection of a developer. The criteria for selecting developers, as suggested by Mr. Nirav Hingoo, are as follows:

- Turnover of 500 Cr.
- Minimum of 5 years of experience
- Minimum of 5 projects completed.

Mr. Sanjay Ajmera, further recommended (before the date of issue of tender) that any Member shall be allowed to bring a developer without agent and with direct approach but only after verifying the above mentioned minimum criteria. He further suggested that once the suggestion or recommendation for developer received by the member, redevelopment committee shall do the adequate due diligence and consider to give the tender.

Considering the explanation provided regarding the challenges of Open tender and benefits Close tender process for redevelopment of society of our size, the Members present in the meeting agreed to go for the Close Tender process. This decision aims to secure offers from top developers efficiently and promptly for the selection of the Developer.

After the comprehensive explanations given by Mr. Nirav Hingoo and Mr. Hitesh Padliya, the Members concurred and decided to proceed with the Close Tender process.

"The Members present in the Meeting consented & agreed to go for the Close Tender process for the Redevelopment of the Society and this decision was passed unanimously."

Proposed by Mr. Chetan Shah (8/27)

Seconded by Mr. Rajendra Prasad Gupta (6/22)

9. Survey and Certification of Area:

Agenda No.4 focused on certifying the area of flats and shops in the society.

Mr. Nirav Hingoo provided revised area measurements based on BMC plans handed over by Society under RTI. Since Occupation Plans of all 8 buildings are not traceable though Building Completion Certificate is there for all buildings. Mr. Nirav Hingoo suggested to go for survey to get the area of flats & shops of all buildings. The society appointed "SJ Surveyor" to measure the area of Ground floor (shops) plus (One) 1 Upper Floor of flats. Mr. Gopal Chokhani and Mr. Ashish Dhanuka explained the Members for necessity of conducting the Survey for identifying the areas of flats & shops for seeking confirmation of the carpet area from Members.

"The Members present in the meeting agreed for carrying out Survey for area measurement of flats & shops and passed unanimously".

Proposed by Mr. N.H. Ajmera (3/17)

Seconded by Mr. Ankur Singhania (4/79)

10. Approval for Redevelopment under Cluster Redevelopment Scheme:

Agenda No.5: Members and tenants had already decided to go for Redevelopment by giving their written consent to the Society. Additionally, they elected Rasik P. Hingoo Architects as our Project Management Consultant (PMC) through a majority vote during the Special General Meeting held on 25th June, 2023.

Furthermore, Mr. Nirav Hingoo proposed Regulation 33(9) Cluster Redevelopment Scheme of DCPR 2034 as the most viable scheme for the Society's redevelopment. He explained this scheme in detail, elaborating on its benefits. Mr. Nirav Hingoo also prepared a feasibility report under Regulation 33(9) Cluster Redevelopment Scheme of DCPR 2034 for the society and shared an updated version of the report under 33(9) with the Members through email. Notably, the minimum corpus fund was raised from Rs 500 to a minimum of Rs 1500 in the Feasibility Report under 33(9). Additionally, a 50% reduction in Premium FSI under CDS 33(9) of DCPR 2034 was taken into consideration.

Advocate Pooja Sharma Mapara, a Member of the Redevelopment Committee, provided an overview of the updated Feasibility Report. She gave description of the society's plot area, as per the Property Card (13,798 sq.mtrs, and the area outlined in the Plain Table Survey Report (12,447 sq.mtrs), abutting road width 18 mtrs. Furthermore, she discussed the eligibility criteria required to go for Cluster Redevelopment Scheme 33(9) of DCPR 2034 i.e the size of the plot should be more than 6000 sq.mtrs & abutting Roadwidth to be 18 mtrs. The society fulfills the eligibility criteria, as the plot area of the Society is more than 6000 sq.mtrs, and the abutting road width is 18 mtrs enabling Society to go for Redevelopment under Regulation 33(9) Cluster

Redevelopment Scheme. During meetings and interactions with the developers, many of them recommended the Cluster Redevelopment Scheme under Regulation 33(9) of DCPR 2034 as the most viable feasible for the Redevelopment of the Society.

Advocate JayPrakash Dhanuka (JP) supplemented this by explaining that the cluster scheme offers substantial benefits due to our over consumed FSI. Choosing any other scheme would likely be less feasible. However, under the cluster scheme, despite overconsumption of the FSI the members would stand to gain more.

To go For Redevelopment under 33(9) Cluster Redevelopment Scheme of DCPR 2034

"The Members present in the meeting consented & agreed to go for Cluster Redevelopment Scheme under Regulation 33(9) of DCPR 2034 for the Redevelopment and passed unanimously"

Proposed by Vinay Garg (1/28)

Seconded by Mrs. Laxmi Kasbekar (4/5)

11. Update on Redevelopment Process:

Agenda No.6 involved updating members on the progress of the redevelopment work. The efforts of the Redevelopment Committee were acknowledged and appreciated.

12. Allocation of Funds for Redevelopment:

Agenda No.7 entailed the allocation of funds for the redevelopment work. Mr. Sanjay Ajmera proposed opening a separate bank account for redevelopment expenses.

An amount of Rs.10,00,000/- was approved to be transferred from the society's account to the redevelopment account.

"The Members present in the meeting consented for the same and passed unanimously"

Proposed by Sanjay Ajmera (3/18)

Seconded by Babita Bubna (5/25)

13. Other Matters with Chair's Permission:

Agenda No.8 covered the use of electronic communication for redevelopment-related notices.

It was resolved to send all the notices via email only, to the respective member as per the records of the Society. Further, if member wants to refer the physical copy, then he can refer the same at society office or if required can take the physical copy without any charges.

"Members present in the meeting consented and passed unanimously"

Proposed by Mr. Ravi B. Dimal (3/11): [Signature]

Seconded by Mr. Ajay Agarwal (1/10): [Signature]

Meeting Conclusion:



The meeting concluded with a vote of thanks extended by the Chairman and Secretary.

For Malad Co-op Housing Society Ltd.


Shri. Deepak Kanodiji
Chairman Of Redevelopment Committee

V. N. Muchhala

Smt. Vibha Muchhala
Deputed Chairperson for Shri. Rajkumar Gupta



Shri. Nathmal Saraf
Treasurer